

Mr Murray Agnew  
Development Standards  
Angus Council  
County Buildings  
Market Street  
FORFAR  
DD8 3LG

Longmore House  
Salisbury Place  
Edinburgh  
EH9 1SH

Direct Line: 0131 668 8924  
Switchboard: 0131 668 8600  
Alasdair.McKenzie@scotland.gsi.gov.uk

Our ref: AMN/16/TA  
Our Case ID: 201405711  
Your ref: 14/00947/EIAM

2 February 2015

Dear Mr Agnew

**The Town and Country Planning (Environmental Impact Assessment) (Scotland) Regulations 2011**

**Saddle Hill Windfarm: Erection of Fourteen Wind Turbines with Blade Tips up to 115m, Foundations, Crane Hardstandings, Around 14 km of Access Track, Two Borrow Pits, a Permanent Anemometry Mast and Ancillary Works  
Planning application and Addendum to Environmental Statement**

Thank you for your consultation of 4 December and the accompanying Environmental Statement for the above development proposal. We received these via the Scottish Government's planning decisions division and this response covers our comments on the Planning Application and its Environmental Statement (ES) for our role as consultees through the Scottish Ministers under the terms of the above Regulations.

We are an agency within the Scottish Government directly responsible to Scottish Ministers for the protection and promotion of the historic environment. Our comments here concentrate on our statutory remit for world heritage sites, scheduled monuments and their setting, category A listed buildings and their setting, and gardens and designed landscapes and historic battlefields appearing in their respective Inventories.

**Historic Scotland's position**

Historic Scotland does not object to this proposal. However, we do consider this proposal will have a significant adverse impact and have provided some advice in the attached annex.

I hope you have found this helpful. Should you wish to discuss this response, please contact me on 0131 668 8924.

Yours sincerely



**Alasdair McKenzie**  
Heritage Management Team Leader (SEA)

## **Background**

Historic Scotland were consulted on the scope of the assessment and our response dated 24 September 2013 highlighted a number of heritage assets that may be significantly affected. We welcome that these have been considered as part of the EIA process.

## **Environmental Statement**

There are numerous scheduled monuments in the vicinity of this proposal and we are generally content with how these have been considered as part of the assessment. A number of photomontages have been provided to illustrate the impacts on the sites assessed in the ES. It would have been helpful if further visualisations were provided for sites out with the immediate study area, however, there is sufficient information to allow us to form a view.

## **Historic Scotland's assessment**

### **Potential Direct Impacts**

We are content that the wind farm has been designed to avoid direct impacts upon nationally important heritage assets.

### **Indirect Impacts (setting)**

The proposal has the potential to impact upon various heritage assets in the vicinity, however, we consider the following to be of greatest significance.

- ***Redlatches, settlement and field system 1900m SSE of (index no. 4640)***  
The monument is a settlement of the later Bronze Age/Iron Age (2000 to 3000 years old), situated on a slight W facing slope on heather moorland. It comprises the remains of six circular stone-walled houses, five of them in an E-W line, the sixth set slightly to the N. In the area around are the remains of a contemporary field system defined by banks, clearance cairns and lynchets.

Their setting can be characterised as open moorland within a rough bowl of land formed by Hill of Fernyhirst, Saddle Hill, Black Hill, Hare Hill, Druim Dearg and Broom Hill. The "bowl" is open to the south-east where there are extensive views to the Strathmore and Kinpurney Hill. There are few modern intrusions other than commercial forestry and a single wind turbine visible to the south-east. The proposed wind farm will intrude into the immediate setting of the settlement and in particular the most north-eastern of the turbines (T13 and T14) which will appear as a dominant feature on the eastern slope of Black Hill. The other remaining three turbines on Black Hill will impact upon the setting of this monument but to a slightly lesser extent.

- ***Redlatches, settlement and field system 1900m S of (index no. 4673)***  
This is a settlement of the Bronze Age/Iron Age (2000 to 3000 years old) situated on an east facing slope. It lies in a clearing left in a commercial forestry plantation. The monument comprises the remains of six circular houses arranged in a rough line along the contour. There are traces of contemporary field walls in the immediate area.

The setting of the monument is characterised as open settlement within a forestry clearing. At present the monument does not have open views in or out of the clearing. The northern most two turbines (T13 and T14), in particular (those on Black Hill) will appear to almost full height to the south of the monument. These two turbines may frame the clearing and have the potential to become dominant elements in the landscape.

- ***Craighead, settlement and field system 900m N of (index no. 5581)***

The monument is a settlement and field system of the Bronze Age or Iron Age situated on the E flank of the Hill of Three Cairns. The settlement consists of eight circular houses constructed of stone-faced, rubble-filled walls. Immediately beside the doorway of the northern house of the pair is a cup-marked rock. Around the houses are elements of a field system, comprising field banks and clearance cairns, and small subsidiary structures.

Based upon our understanding of location of this monument its setting can characterised as open settlement with a forestry clearing. At present the site does not have open views in our out of the clearing. The southern turbines of the proposed development (particularly T2 and T3) will appear to almost full height to the north of the monument. These turbines may frame the clearing and have the potential to become dominant elements in the landscape.

### **Historic Scotland's advice**

Based on the information presented with this application we would assess that magnitude of impact on the above monuments to be high and that there will be a significant adverse impact upon their setting. Mitigation of this impact would require the removal or re-siting of turbines T2/3 and T13/14. We would be happy to comment on any further information or revisions to the scheme that may become available.

### **Historic Scotland's conclusions**

In summary, while the development is likely to have adverse impacts to varying degrees on the setting of a number of scheduled monuments in its vicinity, on the basis of the information provided and site visits we have reached the conclusion for each asset the effect is not so adverse as to raise such issues of national significance that we would object. However, we do recommend that the design layout is re-evaluated to take into take our detailed comments to mitigate impact.

**Historic Scotland  
2 February 2014**